The Personality of Plazas

Two plazas in New York City — Tiffany Plaza in the South Bronx and McKenna Square in Manhattan’s Washington Heights — demonstrate how a plaza’s personality depends on its design and its connection to neighborhood life.

Both plazas, designed by Lee Weintraub and John di Domenico for New York’s housing agency, are familiar yet foreign: They emulate the strong visual and spatial relationship between plazas and churches in traditional Latin communities; and they use materials, colors and visual language similar to that found in the homelands of the neighborhoods’ Hispanic residents. Nevertheless, their design is a striking departure from the surrounding utilitarian landscape of tenements, walk-ups and taxpayer strips.

Tiffany Plaza, which was created by closing a lightly travelled street and molding it with a vacant lot, consists of two formal spaces: a forecourt for St. Athenasius Church and a plaza. The forecourt, which is defined by special granite pavers, includes a raised speakers’ platform that serves as a focal point for gatherings. The plaza is bounded on opposite sides by the church and by an arcade and wall that shelter a linear fountain. Yet, the space flows freely: gatherings spill from the forecourt into the surrounding streets and sidewalks.

Tiffany Plaza has become the anchor for an emerging neighborhood. Since it was built, hundreds of housing units have been constructed or converted out of abandoned buildings in nearby blocks. Like the neighborhood, the plaza’s role has evolved incrementally. It has come to be a place where community residents share their sense of struggle, investment and accomplishment.

At McKenna Square, the designers tried to replicate the same formula. A forecourt extends from St. Rose of Lima Church, across a street and into a small public park; a sculptural rotunda stands on axis with the church entrance and is enclosed by an arcade; and a tree-shaded sitting area is off to the side.

But McKenna Square enjoys neither the use nor the community support that Tiffany Plaza does. The design, Weintraub concludes, suffers from a tenuous rigidity on ideas that worked well at Tiffany and too little attention to the site’s difficult conditions. McKenna Square, a triangular patch created by the merging of two grids, is surrounded by busy streets that could not be closed; even though the forecourt connects the park to the church with special paving, traffic isolates it. Opposite the church is a nondescript row of commercial and residential buildings that establishes neither the presence nor sense of unity that Tiffany’s wall and arcade do.
Above left: Tiffany Plaza, plan.
Above right: The bosque.
Right: The wall and fountain.
Below: Tiffany Plaza, conceptual sketch.
Weintraub also speculates that the difference in neighborhoods also influenced the outcome. By the time McKenna Square was redesigned the surrounding community was relatively well established, and the square had difficulty attracting a constituency.

"One day they went to church and it was there," he explains.

Another lesson these plans offer, Weintraub says, is that designs for neighborhood spaces can have a limited shelf life. As conditions in the community change so will the demands put upon the space. For example, the degree of drug use and homelessness these areas face were not anticipated years ago. At Tiffany Plaza, which had become inhabited by drug dealers, fences now surround the bocce and block off the arcade. Another example is the expansion of the informal economy: street vendors now come to Tiffany Plaza to sell fish, fruits, shaved ice treats and other foods. Had this been anticipated, Weintraub says, the designers would have incorporated better spaces for selling food.

An expectation in both projects was that the church would be the glue that would hold the plaza together. This was true at St. Athanasius, whose pastor, Father Louis Gigante, is committed to the reformation of the neighborhood through the development of affordable housing. Tiffany Plaza serves as a place for religious celebrations and informal gatherings before and after services — a place where, as Weintraub puts it, "people congregate under the watchful eye of the church." But St. Rose of Lima has played less of a role in the development of McKenna Square and the surrounding neighborhood. "It depends on the leadership of the church, not just the institution, but the personalities."

Each plaza itself has a personality, which derives from its design, its sur-